

GRADUATE STUDIES BOARD

MINUTES

Thursday 11 November 2010

9.00-11.00 a.m. in A204

Present: Professor Gary Murphy (Chair), Dr Dermot Brabazon, Dr Pat Brereton, Professor John Costello, Ms Claudine Devereux, Ms Hannah Dyas, Dr Gabriel Flynn, Dr Bernadette Flanagan, Ms Tanya Keogh, Dr Christine Loscher, Ms Louise McDermott (Secretary), Dr Ciarán Mac Murchaidh, Ms Patricia Moore, Dr Anne Morrissey, Professor Colm O’Gorman

Apologies: Dr Françoise Blin, Ms Gillian Barry, Dr Declan Raftery

The Chair welcomed Professor Colm O’Gorman, recently-appointed Associate Dean for Research in Dublin City University Business School, to his first meeting of the Graduate Studies Board. He welcomed Ms Claudine Devereux back to membership of the GSB and expressed the appreciation of the GSB to Ms Mairéad Guinan, who had filled Ms Devereux’s role during the period the latter was engaged in other duties.

SECTION A: MINUTES AND RELATED ISSUES

1. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted subject to the inclusion of three additional submissions under Item 4, two additional submissions under Item 5 and one additional submission under Item 7.

2. Minutes of the meeting of 2 September 2010

The minutes were confirmed and signed by the Chair.

3. Matters arising from the minutes

- 3.1** Noted that the original internal and external examiners, as indicated on the PGR4 form approved by the GSB, had been replaced by a different internal and external examiner and that the nomination of the latter had been approved by Chair's action in October 2010. (Item 5.6 from the meeting of 4 March 2010)
- 3.2** Noted that it was intended shortly to agree a 'go live' date for the implementation of the PAC system for applications from candidates for research degrees. (Item 3.1)
- 3.3** Noted that the Director of Graduate Research was in discussion with Student Support and Development about the possibility of providing support, in Semester 2 2010/11, in terms of academic writing skills for students whose native language is not English. (Item 3.2)
- 3.4** Noted that the provision of web-based forms in the Registry would be addressed once the revised *Academic Regulations for Postgraduate Degrees by Research and Thesis* had been approved and implemented. (Item 3.3)
- 3.5** Noted that it was intended to include on PGR3/4 forms a stipulation to the effect that the current role of the internal examiner and the supervisor should be clearly indicated. (Item 3.4)
- 3.6** Noted that, in a case where two external examiners had been nominated but only one was required, the nomination of the second had been withdrawn. (Item 3.5)
- 3.7** Noted that the position with regard to GSB approval of internal examiners would be included in the revised *Academic Regulations for Postgraduate Degrees by Research and Thesis*. (Item 3.6)
- 3.8** Noted that no students were due to complete the Doctorate of Music in Performance in the Royal Irish Academy of Music in the current academic year and that current and future students would normally be expected to complete the programme over a period of not less than four years. Noted that the University was in discussion with the RIAM with a view to finalising a Memorandum of Understanding. (Item 3.7)
- 3.9** Noted that confirmation had been obtained that the word length of a thesis is appropriate to the award being sought. (Items 3.12, 5.7, 5.22 and 5.37)
- 3.10** Noted that a proposal would be made to the 2 December 2010 meeting of the University Standards Committee that 2.5-credit modules be permitted, as Graduate Training Elements, beyond 2010/11. (Item 3.15)

- 3.11** Noted that the Graduate Training Elements in respect of the Faculty of Science and Health had been approved electronically on 17 September 2010 but that, as had previously been notified by the Faculty, some revisions had become necessary, and that the revised documentation would be circulated electronically to the GSB with a request for formal approval. (Item 3.16)
- 3.12** Agreed that every effort should be made to allow for the approval of the academic structures for 2011/12 on an electronic basis by the GSB in April 2011 so that it would not be necessary to hold an additional meeting. (Item 3.17)
- 3.13** Noted that there had not been any issues with the timing of registration for research students in September and October 2010 and that in fact it is possible for a research student to register at any time of year. (Item 3.17)
- 3.14** Noted that a meeting was scheduled for Monday 15 November 2010 between staff in St Patrick's College and staff in Dundalk Institute of Technology to progress the issue of a Memorandum of Understanding. Agreed that the Chair would ascertain from the President's Office the exact procedure for approving an MoU and would also send Dr Loscher a copy of the draft MoU drawn up by the DRHEA as she is currently in the process of drawing up a similar document. Agreed also that the Chair would discuss with Professor Anne Scott, Deputy President/Registrar, the general University procedures for managing MoUs and ensuring consistency in the way they are drafted. Noted that a proposed MoU template for use when agreements regarding research students are being discussed between institutions would be submitted for the consideration of the GSB at its meeting of 13 January 2011. (Item 3.19)
- 3.15** Noted that confirmation about the role of an internal examiner had been obtained and that the associated PGR4 form had been approved by Chair's action. (Items 4.1 and 5.11)
- 3.16** Noted that confirmation had been obtained that a particular student is not also a staff member. (Items 5.15 and 5.21)
- 3.17** Noted that an award being sought had been clarified as being Master of Business Studies. (Item 5.15)
- 3.18** Noted that a list of a nominated external examiner's publications had been made available. As it was deemed satisfactory, the nomination was approved. (Item 5.20)
- 3.19** Noted that information had been obtained about the date of entry of a student to a research programme. (Item 5.23)

- 3.20** Noted that a nominated external examiner had been approved in respect of a student but that, in respect of another student, an alternative to this nominee was being sought. (Items 5.33 and 5.34)
- 3.21** Noted that an alternative external examiner was being sought for a student. (Items 5.40 and 5.42)
- 3.22** Noted that neither current nor proposed revised regulations preclude the nomination of the same individual twice as external examiner within the same academic year (with the two nominations sometimes being concurrent). Agreed not to make any recommendation to change this practice but to remain vigilant lest it cause any problems in future. (Item 5)
- 3.23** Noted that, in the case of two requests to change supervisor, there was no issue with regard to the proposed new supervisor and both requests had therefore been approved by Chair's action. (Items 6.10 and 6.11)
- 3.24** Noted that the signature of a supervisor was awaited on an R103 (change of supervisory arrangements) form. (Item 6.15)
- 3.25** Noted that the signature of a student was awaited on an R103 (change of supervisory arrangements) form. (Item 6.22)
- 3.26** Agreed that no action was required in respect of the fact that a significant number of supervisors have recently retired, or intend shortly to retire, and noted that the replacement of these supervisors would continue to be managed by Heads of School as part of normal business. (Item 6)
- 3.27** Noted that a recommendation had been made, and approved by Chair's action, to admit a student to the second year of research, on the basis of prior research achievements. (Item 7.1)
- 3.28** Noted that, since the Chair is a member of the working group on the Recognition of Prior Learning, he is in a position to contribute to its deliberations from the perspective of research applications and research issues. (Item 7.1)
- 3.29** Noted that some final comments were still being received in respect of the draft revised *Academic Regulations for Postgraduate Degrees by Research and Thesis*. Agreed that, henceforth, the appointment of additional (as distinct from alternative) supervisors would be dealt with by means of the PGR2 (annual progression) form rather than the R103 form. Agreed that standard issues relating to changes to supervisory arrangements should be dealt with at Faculty level and that issues of

- this kind should be referred to the GSB only if they were not amenable to resolution in the Faculty. (Item 9)
- 3.30** Noted that the issue of credit attribution for attendance at a Summer School was under consideration by a Head of School. (Item 10)
- 3.31** Noted that the Chair intended to draft revised proposals on Higher Doctorates for the consideration of the GSB at its meeting of 13 January 2010. Noted that Dr Mac Murchaidh had made the National University of Ireland regulations in this regard available to the Chair. (Item 11)
- 3.32** Noted that references to the PhD track had been deleted from letters, as appropriate. (item 12.1)
- 3.33** Noted that the Chair had discussed with Professor Anne Scott, Deputy President/Registrar, issues pertaining to the PhD track. (Item 12.1)
- 3.34** Noted, in respect of the Daniel O'Hare scholarships, that an appeal against a decision had been submitted but had not been upheld. Agreed that it would be necessary to review the submission procedures, particularly in view of the fact that both Faculty- and University-level procedures are involved. (Item 12.2)

SECTION B: INDIVIDUAL STUDENT ISSUES

4. Applications for transfer to the PhD register or confirmation on the PhD register

- 4.1 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/4.1, School of Biotechnology
Approved.
- 4.2 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/4.2, School of Biotechnology
Approved.
- 4.3 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/4.3, School of Biotechnology
Approved. The appointment of the external examiner for this student, i.e. of Professor Anna Nicolaou of the University of Bradford, consideration of which had been deferred from the meeting of 2 September 2010, was also approved.
- 4.4 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/4.4, School of Biotechnology
Approved.
- 4.5 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/4.5, Dublin City University Business School
Approved. Noted that the student in question was now in receipt of two scholarships – both a HEA and an IRCHSS scholarship – and would be obliged to relinquish one of them. Agreed that, in the event that the student requested advice about this, she should be referred to the HEA as the body that stipulates that only one scholarship can be held at a time. Noted that

it is not clear from the IRCHSS website that only one scholarship can be held at a time.

- 4.6 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/4.6, School of Chemical Sciences
Approved.
- 4.7 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/4.7, School of Chemical Sciences
Approved.
- 4.8 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/4.8, School of Chemical Sciences
Approved.
- 4.9 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/4.9, School of Communications
Approved.
- 4.10 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/4.10, School of Computing
Approved.
- 4.11 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/4.11, School of Computing
Approved.
- 4.12 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/4.12, School of Computing
Approved.
- 4.13 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/4.13, School of Computing
Approved.
- 4.14 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/4.14, School of Computing
Approved.
- 4.15 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/4.15, School of Education Studies
Approved.
- 4.16 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/4.16, School of Education Studies
Approved subject to the form being signed by the Head of School.
- 4.17 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/4.17, School of Electronic Engineering
Approved.
- 4.18 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/4.18, School of Electronic Engineering
Approved.
- 4.19 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/4.19, School of Electronic Engineering
Approved.
- 4.20 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/4.20, School of Electronic Engineering
Approved.
- 4.21 Student ref. GSB2010/A6/4.21, School of Health and Human Performance
Decision deferred pending the receipt of information about the reason no internal examiner is indicated on the form and written confirmation from the student of willingness to accept the award of MSc since confirmation on the PhD track is not being recommended.
- 4.22 Student ref. GSB2010/A6/4.22, School of Law and Government
Approved.
- 4.23 Student ref. GSB2010/A6/4.23, School of Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering
Approved.

- 4.24 Student ref. GSB2010/A6/4.24, School of Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering
Approved.
- 4.25 Student ref. GSB2010/A6/4.25, School of Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering
Approved.
- 4.26 Student ref. GSB2010/A6/4.26, School of Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering
Approved.
- 4.27 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/4.27, School of Nursing
Approved. Noted that the additional internal examiner should not have been referred to on the form as 'external examiner'.
- 4.28 Student ref. GSB2010/A6/4.28, School of Physical Sciences
Approved subject to the internal examiner signing the form.
- 4.29 Student ref. GSB2010/A6/4.29, School of Physical Sciences
Approved subject to the appropriate box on the form being ticked to indicate approval for confirmation on the PhD register.
- 4.30 Student ref. GSB2010/A6/4.30, School of Physical Sciences
Approved.
- 4.31 Student ref. GSB2010/A6/4.31, School of Physical Sciences
Approved.
- 4.32 Student ref. GSB2010/A6/4.32, School of Physical Sciences
Approved.
- 4.33 Student ref. GSB2010/A6/4.33, School of Electronic Engineering
Approved.
- 4.34 Student ref. GSB2010/A6/4.34, School of Electronic Engineering
Approved.
- 4.35 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/4.35, School of Electronic Engineering
Approved.

5. Appointment of external examiners

- 5.1 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/5.1, PhD, School of Applied Language and Intercultural Studies
Professor Bryan Fanning, University College Dublin
Approved.
- 5.2 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/5.2, PhD, School of Applied Language and Intercultural Studies
Dr Aidan Mulkeen, National University of Ireland, Maynooth
Approved.
- 5.3 Student ref. GSB/20106/A6/5.3, PhD, School of Biotechnology
Professor Gary Walsh, University of Limerick
Approved subject to satisfactory information being obtained about the

- identities of the supervisors involved in previous nominations.
- 5.4 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/5.4, PhD, School of Biotechnology
Dr Philippe Delahaut, CER Groupe, Belgium
Approved.
- 5.5 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/5.5, MBS, Dublin City University Business School
Dr Sarah MacCurtain, University of Limerick
Not approved, on the basis that the potential for a conflict of interest exists.
Agreed to request the School to nominate an alternative external examiner.
- 5.6 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/5.6, PhD, School of Communications
Professor Peter Dahlgren, Lund University
Approved.
- 5.7 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/5.7, PhD, School of Electronic Engineering
Professor John Illingworth, University of Surrey
Approved.
- 5.8 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/5.8, PhD, School of Mathematical Sciences
Professor Paul Matthews, University of Nottingham
Approved.
- 5.9 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/5.9, PhD, School of Mathematical Sciences
Dr Alejandro Raga, UNAM, Mexico
Approved.
- 5.10 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/5.10, PhD, School of Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering
Professor Patrick Prendergast, Trinity College Dublin
Approved.
- 5.11 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/5.11, PhD, School of Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering
Professor Peter McHugh, National University of Ireland, Galway
Approved.
- 5.12 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/5.12, PhD, School of Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering
Dr Peter Williams, University of Limerick
Approved.
- 5.13 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/5.13, PhD, School of Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering
Professor Leo J De Vin, University of Skövde, Sweden
Approved.
- 5.14 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/5.14, PhD, School of Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering
Professor Stewart Robinson, University of Warwick
Approved.

- 5.15 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/5.15, PhD, School of Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering
Professor Joseph Anthony McGeough, University of Edinburgh
Approved.
- 5.16 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/5.16, PhD, School of Physical Sciences
Professor Harry Moseley, University of Dundee
Approved.
- 5.17 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/5.17, PhD, Education Department,
St Patrick's College
Professor Mel Ainscow, University of Manchester
Dr Darleen Opfer, University of Cambridge
Approved.
- 5.18 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/5.18, MA, All Hallows College
Dr Michael Dunne, National University of Ireland, Maynooth
Approved.
- 5.19 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/5.19, PhD, School of Biotechnology
Dr Andy Tubb, University of the West of England
Approved.
- 5.20 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/5.20, PhD, School of Applied Language and Intercultural Studies
Dr Trude Heift, Simon Fraser University, Canada
Approved.

6. Requests for changes to supervisory arrangements

- 6.1 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/6.1, Dublin City University Business School
Approved.
- 6.2 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/6.2, Dublin City University Business School
Approved.
- 6.3 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/6.3, Dublin City University Business School
Approved.
- 6.4 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/6.4, School of Computing
Approved.
- 6.5 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/6.5, School of Computing
Approved.
- 6.6 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/6.6, School of Computing
Approved.
- 6.7 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/6.7, School of Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering
Approved subject to the form being signed by the student.
- 6.8 Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/6.8, School of Nursing
Approved.

7. Other student issues**7.1 Request for special-case admission to the Master's register**

Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/7.1, School of Chemical Sciences

Approved.

7.2 Request for permission to hold a *viva voce* examination in a location in Canada

Student ref. GSB/2010/A6/7.2, School of Law and Government

Approved subject to written confirmation being obtained to indicate that the student is in agreement with the proposal. The Chair undertook to discuss the procedures for conducting the *viva* with the School with a view to ensuring that they will be fit for purpose.

SECTION C: POLICY AND STRATEGY ISSUES**8. Proposed Graduate Training Elements**

None.

9. Supervisors and examiners associated with the NICB

The proposal from the NICB was not approved. It was agreed that consideration of supervisors and examiners would continue to be undertaken on a case-by-case basis. It was agreed also the Chair, Professor Costello and Dr Loscher would meet with the Director of the NICB and that, following this meeting, the Dean of the Faculty of Science and Health would be consulted about the issues.

10. Thesis editing procedures (paid professional editing of theses)

It was agreed to insert a stipulation into the revised *Academic Regulations for Postgraduate Degrees by Research and Thesis* (near the references to plagiarism) to the effect that paying a professional editor to work on a thesis is not permitted. It was agreed that any case of this that might be detected would need to be dealt with on a rigorous basis. It was noted that the distinction between proofreading and editing, where carried out on a thesis by an individual other than the student, can on occasion be a fine one. The Chair undertook to raise the issues at his next meeting with the Associate Deans for Research.

11. Revisions to the procedure for making *aegrotat* awards to research students

Approved.

12. Any other business

None.

Date of next meeting:

**Thursday 13 January 2011
9.00 a.m. in A204**

Signed: _____
Chair

Date: _____