

**GRADUATE STUDIES BOARD****MINUTES**

Thursday 3 July 2008

9.00-11.15 a.m. in A204

**Present:** Professor Gary Murphy (Chair), Dr Françoise Blin, Dr Pat Brereton, Ms Jennifer Dowling, Professor David Jacobson, Ms Tanya Keogh, Dr Christine Loscher, Ms Louise McDermott (Secretary), Dr Andrew McGrady, Ms Noeleen Peel, Dr Mary Shine Thompson

**Apologies:** Dr Tony Cafolla, Dr Declan Raftery, Professor Heather Ruskin

The Chair welcomed Dr Christine Loscher to her first meeting of the GSB. He thanked Dr Andrew McGrady, the outgoing representative from Mater Dei Institute, for his very significant contribution to the GSB since its inception. He noted that Dr Pierre McDonagh's term of office as Associate Dean for Research in Dublin City University Business School had come to an end and that he would therefore no longer be a member of the GSB, and recorded with appreciation his input to the committee since its inception. He noted that Professor David Jacobson was representing the research function in DCUBS for the present.

**SECTION A: Minutes and related issues****1. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted subject to the inclusion of one new submission under Item 4, six new submissions under Item 5, two new submissions under Item 6 and one new submission under Item 8.

**2. Minutes of the meeting of 1 May 2008**

Confirmed and signed by the Chair.

### 3. Matters arising from the minutes

- 3.1 Follow-up actions from the last meeting were reported.
- 3.2 Noted that the Management Committee in St Patrick's College would discuss the possibility of adopting a system similar to *Submission of Theses between September and December*. (Item 3.4)
- 3.3 Noted that an exit survey would be made available from September 2008 and that all students exiting from research degrees would be requested to complete it. Noted that an exit survey had been in use in St Patrick's College for a number of years, and agreed that the Chair would discuss this survey with Dr Shine Thompson so as to ascertain which of its features might be adopted more generally and to avoid duplication of work. (Item 3.7)
- 3.4 Noted that a preliminary working group had met to make recommendations about a *modus operandi* and timescale in relation to the review of *Academic Regulations for Postgraduate Degrees by Research and Thesis*. These recommendations were approved. Agreed that the membership of the working group proper should include a minimum of one Associate Dean for Research as well as a GSB member from a linked college. Agreed that the Chair would approach the Associate Deans and the representatives from the linked colleges about this. Noted that it was intended that the working group proper would meet before the 4 September 2008 meeting of the GSB.

A number of issues to be incorporated into the discussions of the working group were noted. These are listed below.

- Opportunities exist for increasing collaboration across Schools/Faculties in terms of thesis topic, and the regulatory mechanisms for facilitating such collaboration should be examined.
- The information supplied on PGR3 (transfer to the PhD register) and PGR11 (confirmation on the PhD register) forms can be inadequate, and it might be desirable to include a number of headings to facilitate more detailed completion.
- *Curricula vitae* supplied by external examiner nominees can sometimes be too short, or lacking in detail about publications, or difficult to relate, in terms of relevance of expertise, to the abstract of the thesis to be examined. It would not be desirable to require nominees to supply a new, customised CV. However, consideration might be given to requesting them to list a number of publications of particular relevance to the thesis and to requesting those completing the PGR4 (notification of intention to submit thesis for examination) form to be more specific as to the reason an individual is particularly suited for nomination.
- There is no regulation relating to the nomination as external examiner of a person who has retired.

- There is no regulation relating to the relationship between a nominated external examiner and a supervisor, internal examiner or student in terms of co-authorship of publications.
- Where there are two supervisors, both names should be indicated on relevant forms. It will be necessary to discuss the extent to which it might be desirable to stipulate that both supervisors should be staff members of the university.

(Item 3.9)

- 3.5** Noted that progress had been made in clarifying procedures for signing forms where both a School and a Research Centre were involved. (Item 4.8)
- 3.6** Noted that, in a case where two external examiners had been nominated but only one was required, it had been agreed with the relevant School that only one would examine the student, and this nominee had been approved. (Item 6.1)
- 3.7** Noted that, in a case where a fuller CV had been requested for a nominated external examiner, it had been decided instead to nominate a different examiner, and this nomination had been approved. (Item 6.14)
- 3.8** Noted that, in a case where more detailed information had been sought about the supervisory arrangements for a student, the information had been supplied and the nominated external examiner had been approved. (Item 6.22)
- 3.9** Noted that the proposals on graduate research training had been approved by Academic Council at its meeting of 9 June 2008 and that work was now in progress to implement them. (Item 9)
- 3.10** Noted that the proposal on awarding an MD by research was now under discussion in a number of forums in the university. (Item 10)
- 3.11** Noted that work was continuing on the development of good practice in postgraduate tutor training and that the outcome of this work would be incorporated into the implementation of graduate research training (see Item 3.9 above). (Item 11)
- 3.12** Noted that staff members from the linked colleges would participate in the series of workshops on supervision due to take place from Autumn 2008. (Item 12.2)

**SECTION B: Individual student issues****4. Applications for transfer to the PhD register**

- 4.1 Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/4.1, School of Applied Language and Intercultural Studies  
Approved.
- 4.2 Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/4.2, School of Chemical Sciences  
Approved.
- 4.3 Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/4.3, School of Mathematical Sciences  
Approved.
- 4.4 Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/4.4, School of Physical Sciences  
Approved.
- 4.5 Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/4.5, School of Electronic Engineering  
Approved.

**5. Applications for confirmation on the PhD register**

- 5.1 Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/5.1, Dublin City University Business School  
Approved.
- 5.2 Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/5.2, School of Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering  
Approved. Agreed to mention to the relevant staff that the information provided on the form was particularly terse and would have benefitted from some elaboration.
- 5.3 Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/5.3, School of Physical Sciences  
Approved.
- 5.4 Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/5.4, School of Computing  
Approved.
- 5.5 Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/5.5, School of Computing  
Approved.
- 5.6 Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/5.6, School of Nursing  
Approved.
- 5.7 Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/5.7, School of Nursing  
Approved.
- 5.8 Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/5.8, School of Nursing  
Approved.

**6. Appointment of external examiners**

- 6.1 Dr E Swan, Dominican Convent, Blackrock  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.1, PhD, All Hallows College

- Approved subject to the submission of a more detailed *curriculum vitae*, including a list of publications, for the nominee and more explicit confirmation that the nominee's area of expertise is congruent with the subject-matter of the thesis.
- 6.2 Professor P Cunningham, University College Dublin  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.2, PhD, School of Computing  
Approved.
- 6.3 Professor S Thurner, Medical University of Vienna  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.3, PhD, School of Computing  
Approved.
- 6.4 Professor K Nolan, Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.4, PhD, School of Chemical Sciences  
Approved.
- 6.5 Dr W Byers, University of Ulster  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.5, MSc, School of Chemical Sciences  
Approved.
- 6.6 Professor P Sermon, University of Surrey  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.6, PhD, School of Physical Sciences  
Approved.
- 6.7 Dr G Stewart, University of Strathclyde  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.7, PhD, School of Physical Sciences  
Approved.
- 6.8 Dr J Clifford, Milltown Institute  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.8, MA, All Hallows College  
Approved subject to the submission of a more detailed *curriculum vitae*, including a list of publications, for the nominee and more explicit confirmation that the nominee's area of expertise is congruent with the subject-matter of the thesis.
- 6.9 Professor D Swan, University College Dublin  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.9, PhD, All Hallows College  
Approved.
- 6.10 Professor D Peel, Lancaster University Business School  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.10, PhD, Dublin City University Business School  
Approved.
- 6.11 Professor N Hoffman, Université de Reims Champagne-Ardenne  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.11, PhD, School of Chemical Sciences  
Approved.
- 6.12 Dr J Harris, Trinity College Dublin  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.12, PhD, School of Computing  
Approved.
- 6.13 Dr I Patras, Queen Mary University of London  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.13, PhD, School of Electronic Engineering  
Approved.

- 6.14 Dr K O’Gorman, Milltown Institute  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.14, MA, All Hallows College  
Approved subject to the submission of a more detailed *curriculum vitae*, including a list of publications, for the nominee and more explicit confirmation that the nominee’s area of expertise is congruent with the subject-matter of the thesis.
- 6.15 Dr A Tubb, University of the West of England  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.15, PhD, School of Biotechnology  
Approved.
- 6.16 Professor D Wild, University of Warwick  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.16, PhD, NICB/School of Biotechnology  
Approved subject to confirmation that the student does not require two external examiners.
- 6.17 Professor J Masters, University College London  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.17, PhD, NICB/School of Biotechnology  
Approved subject to confirmation that the student does not require two external examiners.
- 6.18 Dr D Smith, Beaumont Hospital  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.18, PhD, NICB/School of Biotechnology  
Decision deferred pending discussion between the Chair and the supervisors.
- 6.19 Professor L Gibbons, University of Notre Dame, Indiana  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.19, PhD, School of Communications  
Approved.
- 6.20 Dr P Bentley, University College London  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.20, PhD, School of Electronic Engineering  
Approved.
- 6.21 Dr G Ellis, National University of Ireland, Galway  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.21, PhD, School of Mathematical Sciences  
Approved.
- 6.22 Dr A Robinson, Trinity College Dublin  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.22, MEng, School of Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering  
Approved.
- 6.23 Professor H Fiedorowicz, Military University of Technology, Warsaw  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.23, PhD, School of Physical Sciences  
Approved.
- 6.24 Dr M Meyer, LIXAM, Université Paris-Sud  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.24, PhD, School of Physical Sciences  
Approved.
- 6.25 Professor R McAdam, University of Ulster  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.25, PhD, Dublin City University  
Business School

- Approved subject to confirmation that the student does not require two external examiners.
- 6.26 Dr J Duberley, University of Birmingham  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.26, PhD, Dublin City University  
Business School  
Approved subject to the submission of a more detailed *curriculum vitae*, including a list of publications, for the nominee.
- 6.27 Dr S O’Dea, National University of Ireland, Maynooth  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.27, PhD, NICB/School of Biotechnology  
Approved.
- 6.28 Professor M Smales, University of Kent  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.28, PhD, NICB/School of Biotechnology  
Approved.
- 6.29 Professor V Campbell, Trinity College Dublin  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.29, PhD, ICNT/School of Biotechnology  
Approved.
- 6.30 Dr G McBean, University College Dublin  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.30, PhD, ICNT/School of Biotechnology  
Approved.
- 6.31 Professor R O’Connor, University College Cork  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.31, PhD, ICNT/School of Biotechnology  
Approved.
- 6.32 Professor A Bond, Monash University, Australia  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.32, PhD, School of Chemical Sciences  
Approved.
- 6.33 Dr S Bennett, The Open University  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.33, PhD, School of Chemical Sciences  
Approved.
- 6.34 Dr P Childs, University of Limerick  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.34, MSc, School of Chemical Sciences  
Approved.
- 6.35 Dr C Waterton, Lancaster University  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.35, PhD, School of Communications  
Approved.
- 6.36 Dr T Smith, University of Limerick  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.36, PhD, School of Chemical Sciences  
Approved.
- 6.37 Professor D Perrett, Barts and the London Queen Mary’s School of  
Medicine and Dentistry  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.37, PhD, School of Chemical Sciences  
Approved.
- 6.38 Professor J Kelly, Trinity College Dublin  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.38, PhD, School of Chemical Sciences  
Approved.

- 6.39 Professor R Zoeller, Florida Atlantic University  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.39, MSc, School of Health and Human Performance  
Approved.
- 6.40 Professor I McGovern, Trinity College Dublin  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.40, MSc, School of Physical Sciences,  
Approved.
- 6.41 Professor E Wall, Mary Immaculate College, University of Limerick  
Professor T Cremin, The Open University  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.41, PhD, Education Department,  
St Patrick's College  
Approved.
- 6.42 Professor D Kiberd, University College Dublin  
Professor A Goarzin, Université Rennes 2  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.42, PhD, English Department,  
St Patrick's College  
Approved. Noted that this was the first time a thesis had been submitted for examination under the 'cotutelle' arrangement between St Patrick's College and Université de la Sorbonne Nouvelle Paris III. Noted that it had been agreed that the *viva voce* examination would take place in private session (in line with practice in Ireland) and would be conducted in English. Noted that the knowledge gained through the implementation of this 'cotutelle' arrangement would be useful in informing future joint research arrangements generally, and agreed that Dr Shine Thompson would make the relevant information available in due course.
- 6.43 Dr T Hickey, University College Dublin  
Dr Á Cregan, Mary Immaculate College, University of Limerick  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.43, PhD, Education Department,  
St Patrick's College  
Approved.
- 6.44 Dr S Kerrigan, Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.44, PhD, School of Biotechnology  
Approved.
- 6.45 Dr S Succi, Istituto per le Applicazioni del Calcolo 'Mauro Picone', Italy  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.45, PhD, School of Computing  
Approved. Agreed to mention to the relevant staff that the names of both supervisors, and not just one, should have been available on the form.
- 6.46 Dr K Thomas, Norwegian Institute for Water Research  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.46, MSc, School of Chemical Sciences  
Approved.
- 6.47 Dr B Crowley, UKAEA Fusion  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.47, PhD, School of Physical Sciences  
Approved.

- 6.48 Professor A Cahill, University of Limerick  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.48, MSc, School of Computing  
Approved subject to the submission of a more detailed *curriculum vitae*, including a list of publications, for the nominee.
- 6.49 Dr B Quinn, University of Limerick  
Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/6.49, PhD, School of Law and Government  
Approved.

## **7. Requests for changes to supervisory arrangements**

- 7.1 Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/7.1, School of Applied Language and Intercultural Studies  
Approved.
- 7.2 Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/7.2, Dublin City University Business School  
Approved.
- 7.3 Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/7.3, Dublin City University Business School  
Approved.
- 7.4 Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/7.4, Dublin City University Business School  
Approved.
- 7.5 Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/7.5, School of Physical Sciences  
Approved.
- 7.6 Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/7.6, School of Mechanical and Manufacturing Engineering  
Approved.
- 7.7 Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/7.7, Dublin City University Business School  
Approved.

## **8. Other student issues**

### **8.1 Application for special-case entry to the PhD-track register**

Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/8.1, School of Nursing  
Approved.

### **8.2 Application for entry to the PhD register**

Student ref. GSB/2008/A4/8.2, School of Nursing  
Approved.

**SECTION C: Policy and strategy issues****9. HEA Quality Review**

- 9.1** Noted with some concern that both the HEA and the IUQB intended to carry out reviews within a short timeframe, though the IUQB had agreed to postpone its review until Autumn 2008 to allow for the fact that the HEA review is due to take place over the Summer. Consultants are being appointed by the HEA, and they will contact the universities in the period July-September so as to complete the review.
- 9.2** Noted that clarification was needed about the relationship between the HEA review and the call for funding submissions under PRTL Cycle 5, which it is hoped will issue soon. Noted that it was very important that the information yielded by the reviews would be of a kind that could usefully inform future funding decisions and that this was perhaps particularly relevant in the case of the Humanities.
- 9.3** Noted that it was intended, under the RGAM (Recurrent Grant Allocation Model), to attribute a double weighting to a non-EU research student (as distinct from the zero weighting which currently applies and the treble weighting which applies to an EU research student).

**10. Draft IUA Graduate Skills Statement**

Agreed that further discussion would be necessary in relation to some of the issues in the draft statement, notably the reference to ‘additional education and training’ (i.e. education and training post PhD) and the extent to which it is desirable, or feasible, that all students acquire all the listed skills. The importance, in terms of enabling students to acquire a wide range of skills, of making a wide range of taught modules available to them was noted. Agreed that the Chair would convey the points raised in discussion to his colleagues in the IUA Fourth-level Ireland Network.

**11. Any other business**

None.

**Date of next meeting:**

**Thursday 4 September 2008  
9.00 a.m. in A204**

Signed: \_\_\_\_\_  
Chair

Date: \_\_\_\_\_